

Brian C. Rocca, S.B. #221576  
brian.rocca@morganlewis.com

Sujal J. Shah, S.B. #215230  
sujal.shah@morganlewis.com

Michelle Park Chiu, S.B. #248421  
michelle.chiu@morganlewis.com

Minna Lo Naranjo, S.B. #259005  
minna.naranjo@morganlewis.com

Rishi P. Satia, S.B. #301958  
rishi.satia@morganlewis.com

**MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP**

One Market, Spear Street Tower

San Francisco, CA 94105

Telephone: (415) 442-1000

Richard S. Taffet, *pro hac vice*

richard.taffet@morganlewis.com

**MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP**

101 Park Avenue

New York, NY 10178

Telephone: (212) 309-6000

*Counsel for Defendants Google LLC, et al.*

Glenn D. Pomerantz, S.B. #112503

glenn.pomerantz@mto.com

Kuruvilla Olasa, S.B. #281509

kuruvilla.olasa@mto.com

Nicholas R. Sidney, S.B. #308080

nick.sidney@mto.com

**MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP**

350 South Grand Avenue, Fiftieth Floor

Los Angeles, California 90071

Telephone: (213) 683-9100

Kyle W. Mach, S.B. #282090

kyle.mach@mto.com

Justin P. Raphael, S.B. #292380

justin.rafael@mto.com

Emily C. Curran-Huberty, S.B. #293065

emily.curran-huberty@mto.com

Dane P. Shikman, S.B. #313656

dane.shikman@mto.com

**MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP**

560 Mission Street, Twenty Seventh Floor

San Francisco, California 94105

Telephone: (415) 512-4000

Jonathan I. Kravis, *pro hac vice*

jonathan.kravis@mto.com

**MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP**

601 Massachusetts Avenue NW, Suite 500E

Washington, D.C. 20001

Telephone: (202) 220-1100

Neal Kumar Katyal, *pro hac vice*

neal.katyal@hoganlovells.com

Jessica L. Ellsworth, *pro hac vice*

jessica.ellsworth@hoganlovells.com

**HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP**

555 Thirteenth Street, NW

Washington, D.C. 20004

Telephone: (202) 637-5600

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
2 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
3 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION  
4  
5  
6

7 **IN RE GOOGLE PLAY STORE**  
8 **ANTITRUST LITIGATION**

Case No. 3:21-md-02981-JD

9 This Document Relates To:

10 *In re Google Play Consumer Antitrust*  
*Litigation*, Case No. 3:20-cv-05761-JD

11 *State of Utah et al. v. Google LLC et al.*,  
Case No. 3:21-cv-05227-JD

**DECLARATION OF JUSTIN P.**  
**RAPHAEL IN SUPPORT OF**  
**DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR LEAVE**  
**TO FILE SUPPLEMENTAL BRIEF IN**  
**SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS' MOTION**  
**TO EXCLUDE MERITS OPINIONS OF**  
**DR. HAL J. SINGER**

Judge: Hon. James Donato  
Date: August 3, 2023  
Time: 10:00 a.m. Pacific Time  
Courtroom: 11, 19th Floor, 450 Golden Gate  
Ave, San Francisco, California,  
94102

**DECLARATION OF JUSTIN P. RAPHAEL**

I, Justin P. Raphael, hereby declare:

1. I am admitted to practice before all of the courts of the State of California and this Court. I am an attorney at the law firm of Munger, Tolles & Olson LLP and counsel of record for Defendants in the above-captioned matter. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth in this declaration, and, if called as a witness, I could and would testify competently to the matters set forth herein

2. On October 3, 2022, Consumer Plaintiffs served on Google the Expert Report of Hal J. Singer, Ph.D. On December 23, 2022, Consumer Plaintiffs served the Expert Reply Report of Hal J. Singer, Ph.D. (“Singer Reply Report”). Attached hereto as **Exhibit A** is a true and accurate copy relevant excerpts from the Singer Reply Report.

3. On April 20, 2023, Google filed its Motion to Exclude Merits Opinions of Dr. Hal J. Singer (“Motion to Exclude”). On April 27, 2023, after Google filed its Motion to Exclude, lead trial counsel for all member cases held an in-person trial “summit” to discuss a plan and sequencing of the cases in this MDL for trial. At that trial summit, Google asked counsel for Consumer Plaintiffs how Plaintiffs intended to prove damages for any individual plaintiffs at trial. Google reiterated that inquiry by email on May 5, 2023, asking “how Plaintiffs intended to prove damages for individual plaintiffs if they are going to be part of the trial.” Consumer Plaintiffs’ counsel responded on May 6, 2023, informing Google’s counsel that Plaintiffs “will be supplementing the reports to provide the calculation of damages for the individual plaintiffs under all of the models previously disclosed by Dr. Singer.” A true and correct copy of this correspondence is attached hereto as **Exhibit B**.

4. On May 12, 2023, Consumer Plaintiffs served on Google a Supplemental Expert Report of Hal J. Singer, Ph.D. Attached hereto as **Exhibit C** is a true and accurate copy of relevant excerpts from this report.

5. On June 16, 2023, Google served on Plaintiffs a Supplemental Expert Rebuttal Report by Dr. Gregory Leonard responding to Dr. Singer’s Supplemental Expert Report. Attached

1 hereto as **Exhibit D** is a true and accurate copy of relevant excerpts from Dr. Leonard's rebuttal  
2 report.

3 6. More than three weeks after the close of briefing on Google's Motion to Exclude,  
4 on June 30, 2023, Dr. Singer submitted a Supplemental Expert Reply Report, along with certain  
5 backup work papers. Attached hereto as **Exhibit E** is a true and accurate copy of relevant excerpts  
6 from that report. Attached hereto as **Exhibit F** is a true and accurate copy of relevant portions of  
7 those backup work papers.

8 7. Google deposed Dr. Singer regarding his supplemental reports on July 18, 2023.  
9 Attached hereto as **Exhibit G** is a true and accurate copy of relevant excerpts from that deposition  
10 transcript.

11 8. On July 25, 2023, I emailed counsel for Plaintiffs asking whether they would  
12 stipulate to Google's request for leave to file a supplemental brief in support of Google's Motion  
13 to Exclude the Merits Opinions of Dr. Singer. On July 26, 2023, Plaintiffs' counsel indicated that  
14 Plaintiffs would not stipulate to Google's request for leave. A true and correct copy of my  
15 correspondence with Plaintiffs' counsel is attached hereto as **Exhibit H**.

16 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the  
17 foregoing is true and correct.

18 Executed on this 26th day of July, 2023, at San Francisco, California.

19  
20 s/ Justin P. Raphael

21 Justin P. Raphael  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**E-FILING ATTESTATION**

I, Sujal J. Shah, am the ECF User whose ID and password are being used to file this document. In compliance with Civil Local Rule 5-1(h)(3), I hereby attest that counsel for Defendants have concurred in this filing.

/s/ Sujal J. Shah

Sujal J. Shah